



Energy Efficiency Collaboratives

Working together to save energy in the Midwest

What is an Energy Efficiency Collaborative?

Stakeholder collaboration is a tool utilized by policymakers, as well as private and non-governmental organizations, to provide a forum for discussion and collaborative decision-making regarding policy and other issues. Public stakeholder collaborative processes can engage businesses, consumers, industry experts and advocates to help shape states' energy plans, policies and programs. Collaboratives can help avoid litigation and move involved parties more quickly towards implementation. Likewise, they can help identify issues where agreement cannot be reached, where a stronger commission role is required. Seven states in the Midwest use or have used some form of stakeholder collaborative to address energy efficiency.

There is no "one size fits all" approach to energy efficiency collaboratives. Some states have adopted long-term stakeholder forums under which the group meets regularly over an extended period. Other states have created shorter-term collaboratives to consider specific policies or issues over a limited timeframe. Some collaboratives are convened on a statewide basis, while others are utility-specific. Statewide collaboratives can be created through legislation, regulatory orders or the action of state agencies. Participation in most collaboratives in the Midwest is open to the public, with program administrators, utility staff, state agencies, energy efficiency-related businesses and advocacy organizations comprising the majority of the attendees.

Types of Energy Efficiency Collaboratives

There are four general types of public energy efficiency collaboratives and a related, but non-public, stakeholder group that some states allow or require utilities to convene:

- **Enhanced collaborative:** Characterized by a significant operating budget, statutory permanence and a broad array of specific tasks and responsibilities.
- **Permanent statewide collaborative:** Created to address issues for all electric utilities (and possibly gas) in the state; is permanent as the result of statute, commission order or track record; has a smaller budget relative to an enhanced collaborative; and could rely more on peer review and input to complete tasks rather than dedicated staff.
- **Utility-specific collaboratives:** Set up by the commission to foster stakeholder input for a single utility and otherwise operates in a similar manner to a permanent statewide collaborative.
- **Temporary collaboratives:** Created to examine a defined set of issues and is disbanded after completing its mission.
- **Utility advisory board:** A non-public entity created by a utility or regulatory body that

operates under the direction of the utility. While they provide input to the utility on energy efficiency, because they are not open to the public, they are not a true stakeholder collaborative. (SEEAAction 2015)

Of the types of groups identified above, Midwest states have adopted the following:

- **Permanent statewide collaborative:** Illinois, Iowa, Michigan, Missouri
- **Utility-specific collaboratives:** Missouri
- **Temporary collaboratives:** Minnesota, Kentucky
- **Utility advisory boards:** Ohio

There are a number of reasons to favor the permanent statewide collaborative model (or the enhanced collaborative, though none exist in the Midwest). By bringing all the stakeholders to the same table, participants can spend their time and resources more efficiently than having the same discussions in multiple separate meetings, an especially important consideration for government agencies and advocacy organizations. The statewide model can also facilitate consistency and standardization in plans and reports, support collaborative efforts between program administrators such as dual-fuel programs, and provide a forum for program administrators to share common challenges and best practices.

Regardless of the structure or objective of the stakeholder group, several elements can help ensure a strong collaborative process. The list below shows these elements and provides examples of the four permanent statewide collaboratives in the Midwest.

- **Broad group of knowledgeable stakeholders representing a variety of interests**
Example: Illinois, Iowa, Michigan, Missouri
- **Open to the public – any interested individual can attend**
Example: Illinois, Iowa, Michigan, Missouri
- **Clearly defined objectives**
Example: Illinois, Iowa, Michigan, Missouri
- **Independent facilitator**
Example: Illinois (contracted facilitator), Iowa (non-regulator government agency)
- **Regularly scheduled meetings with agenda**
Example: Illinois, Iowa, Missouri, Michigan
- **Open communication and sharing of information**
Example: Illinois, Missouri (web), Michigan, Iowa (email list)

Detailed information on the four permanent statewide collaboratives in the Midwest is in the Appendices.

References:

SEEAAction [State and Local Energy Efficiency Action Network]. 2015. *Energy Efficiency Collaboratives*. Accessed at <https://www4.eere.energy.gov/seeaction/publication/energy-efficiency-collaboratives>

Appendix: Permanent Statewide Energy Efficiency Collaboratives

Illinois

Name of Collaborative	Illinois Energy Efficiency Stakeholder Advisory Group (IL SAG)
Authorized By	Illinois Commerce Commission (ICC) orders in Dockets 07-0540 and 07-0539. Scope was broadened by subsequent orders in 10-0562, 10-0564, 10-0568, 10-0569, 10-0570, 13-0077, 13-0498, 13-0495, 13-0499, 13-0549 and 13-0550
Year Convened	2008
Convener	Future Energy Enterprises
Participants	Meetings are open to all interested participants, except where topics relate to confidential or proprietary information. A full list of SAG participants is available on the SAG website . Active participants include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Program administrators • Utility staff • State agencies • State regulator staff • Energy efficiency-related businesses • Advocacy organizations
Scope of Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review final program designs • Establish agreed-upon performance metrics for measuring portfolio and program performance • Review EE Plan progress against metrics and against statutory goals on a quarterly basis, including budget spend and savings achievement • Review program additions or discontinuations • Review draft program evaluation reports • Review new proposed programs for the next program cycle • Review program budget shifts between programs where the change is more than 20% • Discuss annual updates to the Illinois TRM & Illinois EE Policy Manual for approval by the ICC • Discuss unresolved issues as directed by the ICC
Collaborative Schedule	Monthly in-person meetings held in Chicago. Calls, subcommittee meetings and workshops as scheduled. The calendar can be found at http://www.ilsag.info/meeting-schedule---calendar.html
Products Developed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Illinois TRM • Illinois EE Policy Manual
Website	http://www.ilsag.info/
Contact	Celia Johnson, Future Energy Enterprises celia.johnson@futee.biz

Appendix: Permanent Statewide Energy Efficiency Collaboratives

Iowa

Name of Collaborative	Iowa Energy Efficiency Collaboration
Authorized By	Settlement Agreement and Iowa Utilities Board's (IUB) Order Approving Settlement Agreements regarding investor-owned energy efficiency plans in 2009 and 2013. Relevant orders are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Interstate Power and Light</i>: Docket EEP-2008-0001, Final Order (6/24/09); EEP-2012-0001, Final Order (12/2/13). • <i>MidAmerican</i>: Docket EEP-2008-0002, Order Approving Settlement and Energy Efficiency Plan (3/9/09); EEP-2012-0002, Final Order (12/16/13). • <i>Black Hills</i>: Docket EEP-2008-0003, Order Approving Settlement and Energy Efficiency Plan (3/3/09); EEP-2013-0001, Order Approving Settlement (12/17/13).
Year Convened	2009; renewed 2013
Convener	Office of Consumer Advocate (OCA)
Participants	Open to all interested persons statewide. Active participants include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Investor-owned, municipal and cooperative utility staff • State agencies • Environmental groups • Energy efficiency contractors and trade allies • Propane association • IUB staff in an observatory role
Scope of Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review and discussion of plan performance and new program offerings • Collaborate on topics of interest, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contractor/auditor training and QA • Consumer education • Residential and agricultural energy audits • Grants and funding opportunities • Energy code compliance • Multifamily and low-income energy efficiency • Benchmarking • Partnership for Industrial Energy Efficiency • Federal lighting standards
Collaborative Schedule	May: Annual Report filing & Q&A; June: Annual Report Reviews; November: Operational Reports. Investor-owned utilities convene the fall operations meetings to provide stakeholders with updates on annual energy efficiency plan progress and allow an opportunity for input regarding anticipated program changes. Subcommittees meet as needed to complete projects.
Products Developed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Technical Reference Manual (9/30/16) • Net-to-Gross Report (11/25/15) • See Docket EEP-2012-0001, EEP-2012-0002 or EEP-2013-0001
Website	The Iowa collaborative does not have a web site.
Contact	Sheila Parker, Office of Consumer Advocate sheila.parker@oca.iowa.gov

Appendix: Permanent Statewide Energy Efficiency Collaboratives

Michigan

Name of Collaborative	Michigan Energy Waste Reduction Collaborative
Authorized By	Michigan Public Service Commission (MPSC) Order in Dockets U-15805 and U-15806
Year Convened	2009
Convener	MPSC Energy Waste Reduction (EWR) staff
Participants	Meetings (in person or by conference call) are open to the public and all interested participants. Active participants include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Program administrators • State agencies • Energy efficiency-related businesses and contractors • Utility staff • Advocacy organizations
Scope of Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make recommendations for improving Energy Waste Reduction (EWR) plans • Provide program evaluation support • Develop any needed redesign and improvements to energy efficiency programs • Update and refine Michigan Energy Measures Database (MEMD) based on actual program experience • Provide a forum to connect Michigan manufacturers, suppliers and vendors with utility EWR programs • Convene EWR Collaborative workgroups: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation/Program Implementation Workgroup • Technical subcommittee
Collaborative Schedule	Meetings are held on third Tuesday of every month (with call-in option provided)
Products Developed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Michigan Energy Measures Database
Website	http://www.michigan.gov/mpsc/0,4639,7-159-52495_53750---,00.html
Contact	Dave Walker, Michigan Public Service Commission walkerd12@michigan.gov

Appendix: Permanent Statewide Energy Efficiency Collaboratives

Missouri

Name of Collaborative	Missouri Statewide Advisory Collaborative
Authorized By	The rule implementing the Missouri Energy Efficiency Investment Act (MEEIA) was updated in Docket EX-2016-0334 and the Missouri Public Service Commission (PSC) filed the final order of rulemaking on 6/28/17. The rulemaking will likely be filed in August 2017 and the updated rule will be effective 30 days later. The updated rule will be Commission Rule 4 CSR 240-20.094(9).
Year Convened	Original rule effective 7/31/12; 1 st collaborative held 7/31/13.
Convener	Missouri Public Service Commission (the first collaborative in 2013 was convened by the Missouri Division of Energy and the Missouri Energy Initiative)
Participants	All interested persons may attend. Active participants include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Investor-owned electric utility staff • Utility customer groups • State agencies • Energy/environmental organizations • Other parties involved in DSM program filings under MEEIA
Scope of Work	The MEEIA final rule (4 CSR 240-20.094(9)) establishes the following role for the collaborative: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop statewide EM&V protocols. • Establish working groups to create collaborative deliverables. • Create a semi-annual utility and stakeholder forum for discussion and resolving policy issues. • Explore other energy efficiency opportunities. • Meet semi-annually as a collaborative and schedule additional meetings and conference calls as needed.
Collaborative Schedule	Semi-annual meetings. Schedule is set by PSC.
Products Developed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Statewide TRM (developed with Division of Energy as lead under a US DOE federal SEP competitive grant) has been submitted to the PSC for review under 4 CSR 240-20.094(10).
Website	Annual meeting materials (2014, 2015 and 2016) are posted in an open working docket on PSC's website, Docket EW-2013-0519.
Contact	Brenda Wilbers, Department of Economic Development brenda.wilbers@ded.mo.gov